

## **Challenges and Opportunities for Regional Public Service Media: A Singular Case Study in Europe**

JESSICA IZQUIERDO-CASTILLO<sup>1</sup>  
University Jaume I, Spain

JUAN CARLOS MIGUEL-DE-BUSTOS  
University of Basque Country, Spain

Technological convergence has forced television networks to reinvent themselves as multiplatform online distribution media, which may lead such networks to question the utility of the public media system and its financing models. At the same time, a global economic crisis caused budget cuts for public service broadcasters, forcing the closure of some of them. First, it was the Greek ERT in June 2013. The same year, in November, a regional Spanish public television was closed as well; this was also due to political decisions. This article presents a study of the reopening of this regional Spanish Public Service Media (PSM) in 2018. This is a singular case in Europe, as it was the first PSM that was conceived from the outset as a convergent media network. The results show many challenges related to political action, which reveal the need for an effective governance system that can provide PSM that are neutral and independent.

*Keywords: public service media, convergence, media ecosystem, public service broadcasting, public television*

Technological convergence has forced television networks to reframe themselves as multiplatform online distribution media (Creeber & Hills, 2007; Meike & Young, 2008). In the case of public television, convergence requires the conversion of Public Service Broadcasting (PSB) to Public Service Media (PSM), which gives rise to a strong debate on the role of public media in the digital age (Aslama & Syvertsen, 2007). The term “PSM” tries to encompass the transformations that PSB must face due to digitization and the Internet (Donders, 2012), and it is associated with a multiplatform and multimedia broadcast.

The legitimacy of PSM is under question worldwide. In Australia, for instance, the Liberal Party was determined to privatize the public broadcaster, ABC. In Europe, there is a rich scenario of public

---

Jessica Izquierdo-Castillo: [jizquier@uji.es](mailto:jizquier@uji.es)

Juan Carlos Miguel-de-Bustos: [jc.miguel@ehu.es](mailto:jc.miguel@ehu.es)

Date submitted: 2019-07-31

<sup>1</sup> This research project had the collaboration of Corporació Valenciana de Mitjans Audiovisuals [Valencian Corporation of Audiovisual Media], which participated in the interviews.

Copyright © 2021 (Jessica Izquierdo-Castillo and Juan Carlos Miguel-de-Bustos). Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution Non-commercial No Derivatives (by-nc-nd). Available at <http://ijoc.org>.

media, but the last global economic crisis of 2008 sharpened the precarious situation of some public broadcasters, provoking a decrease of resources and legitimacy. For instance, the Swiss *No Billag* initiative for Swiss PSM was finally rejected, and a 20% cutback was applied to Danish PSM. These cases show a tendency across Europe, although not all countries are affected equally. Greece was used as "a guinea pig to test the conditions for restructuring late capitalism in crisis" (Douzinas, 2013, p. 6), and one of the many consequences was the shutdown of its public service broadcaster. Also, in 2013, a regional Spanish PSB, the Valencian PSB Radiotelevisió Valenciana (RTVV), that controlled two radio stations, three television channels, and one website, was closed down. The service was then recovered four years later, and it must now meet the requirements of the convergent scenario.

What is most interesting about the Valencian case is that it is a PSM born in the full consolidation of the convergent media scenario. It lacks previous structures, and has the opportunity to create a modern PSM, adapted to the Internet and the demands of digital audiences. Despite this, however, it is conditioned by the same factors that threaten the survival of public television (politics, technology, public funding, audience habits, etc.), so the question arises of whether it is possible to develop a proper PSM in the current digital media ecosystem.

This study allows us to observe the challenges and opportunities for the implementation of new convergent digital media, which can serve as a mirror for dozens of both Spanish and European broadcasters that are still dealing with technological transitions.

Firstly, we examine the consolidation of convergent television, which has transformed both the structure and functions of television. Then, we discuss the responsibility of PSM in the digital era, in which it is called to play a leading role for innovation and technological convergence.

### **Media Convergence and the Responsibility of Public Service Media**

Lineal television "is still a vertebral system in the media industry and for communication and information general interest within the European Union"<sup>2</sup> (Campos, 2017, p. 148). However, television has become a distribution platform that progressively operates through the Internet. In the hypertelevision era (Scolari, 2008), barriers between broadcasters and audiences are diluted. Thus, content programming is relocated to face new consumption habits (Izquierdo-Castillo, 2017) characterized by multiplicity (Franquet, 2017) and new narratives.

In the context of journalism, convergence involves an "integration of tools, spaces, work methods and languages" (Salaverría & Negro, 2009, p. 21). This demands multiplatform production routines, which cause changes in the media companies (Larrondo, 2017). Newsrooms may encounter problems of resilience and resistance to change (Ryfe, 2009). Journalists must be able to embrace the convergent culture (Menke et al., 2016). In this sense, there have been problems of adaptation in some public service broadcasters, where convergence is perceived as "inevitable by managers, editors and journalists, even if many resist the changes at the same time" (Larrondo, Domingo, Erdal, Masip, & Van Den Bulck, 2014, p. 296).

---

<sup>2</sup> Translated by authors.

Today, convergent media systems are consolidated (Canavilhas, 2015; Scolari, 2015), and traditional media are confronted by disruptive models, which position themselves as new power players within the digital media ecosystem (Cunningham & Silver, 2013), in which large companies also have media interests (Miguel-de-Bustos & Izquierdo-Castillo, 2019). However, it is worth noting that convergence must not only be understood as an industrial, market, and a technological phenomenon but also as a process that has a high cultural impact (Islas, 2009; Maxwell & Miller, 2011) and that promotes interaction with users (Jenkins, 2008). Media convergence creates greater challenges for PSM. The transition from PSB to PSM is a complex process, characterized by the involvement of several dimensions (to become a more demand-oriented service, to implement cross-media and cross-genre strategies, to achieve proper policies, etc.; Lowe & Bardoel, 2007).

In this fragmented scenario, some authors have long been drawing attention to the emergence of voices that are critical of the functionality of public media as a consequence of the dissolution of the boundaries between service and commercialization (Syvertsen, 2003; Tracey, 1998). Since the late 1980s, PSM have been suffering from an intermittent legitimacy crisis, as a consequence of commercial broadcasters, political attacks, a decrease in public investment, and technological challenges (Rowland & Tracey, 1990). Public televisions have been "under criticism, their legitimacy thwarted by technological, cultural and political developments" (Padovani, 2007, p. 215). Precisely with the consolidation of the Internet, many scholars affirmed the role of PSM as the driving force for the development of the information society, as well as the guarantors of public services (Blake, Lovegrove, Pryde, & Strauss, 1999; Meier, 2003; Moe, 2008; Steemers, 2003; Storsul & Syvertsen, 2007; Zallo, 2014). The role of PSM is extensive because public media contribute not only to promoting the democratic development of an informed and participatory society but also help decelerate the concentration of media services (Medina & Ojer, 2009; Trappel, 2008), ensuring diversity (Hoffman, Lutz, Meckel, & Ranzini, 2015).

### **Regional Spanish Television**

The structure of Spanish public television consists of one national PSM (Radiotelevisión Española—RTVE) and 13<sup>3</sup> regional broadcasters. This responds to the political structure of Spain, where there are 17 autonomous communities besides the central government. Not all the regions have their own public media. In the 1980s, a process of media decentralization was undertaken in Spain, as it was in other European countries (such as Germany or Switzerland). What differentiates the Spanish case is the autonomous character of each of the public broadcasters, among which there is almost no collaboration, not even with the national public broadcaster.

The result of this decentralization was a new territorial imperative for the media, which were characterized as being transnationalist, regionalist, and multicultural (Maxwell, 1995). The different regional governments demanded their own media, claiming to serve the three main objectives: promoting

---

<sup>3</sup> There are also two public televisions in Ceuta and Melilla. However, these are not regions, but autonomous cities, with small populations.

the language (Spain has four co-official languages besides Spanish), covering cultural and educational potential, and articulating their territories.

The management of these media is dependent on each regional government, which have delegated functions for public broadcasting. Each of these regional PSM covers a population of between 85 thousand and 7.6 million (see Table 1), and their budget is dependent on regional political supplies. These factors have contributed to building a public media system based on patronage, instrumentalization, and political parallelism (Fernández, 2017).

The Spanish regional PSM are independent both horizontally (regional system) and vertically (with respect to national RTVE). They have only a nominal coordination under the FORTA<sup>4</sup> (Regional PSM Federation), used mainly to jointly manage purchases from third parties, produce news material, and negotiate advertising commercialization among the members (Mateos, Ruano, & Ardèvol, 2012). Besides, the funding model lets regional public media combine public budgets with advertising, but not the national broadcaster RTVE.

This regional system combines big and small PSM, but also reflects a strong imbalance when in-home data are compared. The biggest regional network is clearly the Catalan Media Corporation, with 2,219 employees and a public budget of 231 million euros. That of Andalusia follows this, with more than 1,460 employees. In the third position is the former Valencian public media (RTVV), with 1,700 employees and a budget of 154 million before its closure in 2013. Table 1 shows this national imbalance: Catalonia has 9% less population than Andalusia, but it has 42% more public funding.

---

<sup>4</sup> All of them, except Extremadura, Ceuta and Melilla.

**Table 1. Regional PSM in Spain:  
Population, Public Investment, Employees, and Public Investment per Person.**

Position per public investment (PI)	Region	Population	PSM			PI/person (€)
			Name	PI (M€)	Employees	
1	Catalonia	7,600,065	Corporació Catalana de Mitjans Audiovisuals (CCMA)	231.0	2,219	30.4
2	Andalusia	8,384,408	Agencia Pública Empresarial de la Radio Televisión de Andalucía (RTVA)	162.8	1,462	19.4
3*	Valencian Community	4,963,703	Radiotelevisión Valenciana (RTVV)*	154.0	1,700	31.0
3	Basque Country	2,199,088	Euskal Irrati Telebista (EiTB)	127.4	1,003	57.9
4	Galicia	2,701,743	Corporación Radio e Televisión de Galicia (CRTVG)	97.2	955	36.0
5	Madrid	6,578,079	Radio Televisión Madrid (RTVM)	70.3	457	10.7
6	Valencian Community	4,963,703	Corporació Valenciana de Mitjans de Comunicació (CVMC)**	55.0	351	11.1
7	Aragon	1,308,728	Corporación Aragonesa de Radio y Televisión (CARTV)	47.0	136	35.9
8	Canary Islands	2,127,685	Ente público Radiotelevisión Canaria (RTVC)	45.0	147	21.1
9	Castilla La Mancha	2,026,807	Castilla-La Mancha Media (CMM)	38.9	460	19.2
10	Balearic Islands	1,128,908	Ens Públic de Radiotelevisió de les Illes Balears (EPRTVIB)	31.0	147	27.5
11	Extremadura	1,072,863	Corporación Extremeña de Medios Audiovisuales (CEXMA)	24.2	210	22.6
12	Principality of Asturias	1,028,244	Radiotelevisión del Principado de Asturias (RTPA)	20.0	147	19.5
13	Murcia	1,478,509	Radiotelevisión de la Región de Murcia (RTRM)	15.0	64	3.4
14	Ceuta	85,144	Radio Televisión Ceuta (RTVCE)	2.5	31	28.2

\*RTVV was opened in 2009 and closed in 2013.

\*\*CVMC is the owner of À Punt Media (APM), which was opened in 2017.

Source: EFE (2018); Instituto Nacional de Estadística (2018).

Audience rates are also irregular. In Catalonia, Aragon, and Andalusia these are over 10%, whereas À Punt Media (APM) registered an annual average of 1.4% in 2018 (period October–December) and a slightly better 1.9% for the period January–June 2019.

The Spanish public television system has been suffering a crisis of legitimacy (Miguel-de-Bustos & Casado, 2012). In fact, some of the regional broadcasters show high commercial and governmental biases, which are continuously reported by their own staff. The crisis of the regional model is provoked, among other factors, by the promotion of externalization (Sarabia, Sánchez, & Fernández, 2012), and also by a process of austerity and apparent patronage (Fernández, 2017). However, the factor that best explains the crisis of regional public television in Spain, even more than underfinancing, is endemic political interference (Casado, Miguel-de-Bustos, & Sarabia, 2017, p. 215).

### **Objectives and Methodology**

The main objective of this article is to identify the challenges and opportunities in the implementation of new public service media, in a context of media convergence.

We can identify three secondary objectives:

- O1: To identify the axes on which the new PSM is built: political situation, budget, and social demand.*
- O2: To collect the PSM managers' experiences about the process of implementation, and about the identification they make of influencing factors and how these affect the media management.*
- O3: To contribute to the debate on the leadership role that PSM must play through their position as regional public media.*

We analyze the case study of APM. The case study method allows us to carry out an empirical inquiry using multiple sources of evidence to analyze a contemporary phenomenon at the moment in which it is taking place (Yin, 1994). The selection of the case is doubly justified. First, it responds to the creation of a new public television. Second, this creation has taken place in an unexplored context for a new medium, the convergent scenario. Despite the fact that all public broadcasters have been facing the transition to convergence in the past decade, which affects areas such as production routines, multiplatform synergies, and the inner structure of the newsrooms (Larrondo, 2017), this case study has the singularity that it concerns a medium that has been rebuilt according to convergent media ecosystem requirements.

This case study comprises the characteristics identified by Merriam (1988; particularistic, descriptive, heuristic, and inductive). Therefore, it aims to achieve a detailed description of the phenomenon, understanding its particularity as a multiplatform PSM. It also offers new perspectives and interpretations about the debate on the role of PSM in the digital era. Moreover, APM's structure and size is similar to that of many European broadcasters, for whom it may serve as a relevant example. We consider that public media should respond to these elements: principles, remit, organization, funding, governance, programming, and audience.

We apply a qualitative method that combines two parallel techniques. First, we conduct an exploratory documentary review to describe the precedent, Canal 9, thus making it possible to establish

the axes on which the case of APM has been built. We use corporate reports, related regulations, specialized press, and a literature review. We also take the works of different authors edited by Izquierdo-Castillo and López-Rabadán (2016), Marzal, Izquierdo-Castillo, and Casero (2015), and Marzal, López-Rabadán, and Izquierdo-Castillo (2017). These works delve into the factors that have caused the crisis of regional television (such as political interests, economic crisis, and decrease of audience) and assert the indispensability of PSM in the digital scenario, based on linguistic, social, and cultural demands.

Second, we conduct the core analysis, with 15 in-depth interviews conducted with those responsible for different areas of the PSM: the general manager, programming and content services, news and sports, engineering and operating, Web content and social media, innovation and new formats, social projection, image, communication, and style and linguistic resources. The technique was based on semistructured interviews, lasting from 60 to 90 minutes, audio recorded in person in the APM building.<sup>5</sup> The interviews were analyzed using Atlas.ti 8 software, which makes it possible to identify both formal and nonformal discourse on challenges and opportunities of the design and implementation of the media, which are coded under these two categories. The results of this technique are related to Objectives 2 and 3.

## Results

### ***Precedent of the Valencian PSM: Canal 9***

The Valencian Community has coverage of almost 4.9 million people (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 2018), similar to that of some small European countries like Norway (5.4M), Ireland (4.8M), Croatia (4.2M), and Moldova (4M) (Worldmeters, 2018).

The previous broadcaster was Radiotelevisió Valenciana (RTVV), most commonly known by its main television channel, Canal 9. It was established in 1984 as one of the first regional public televisions, but it first aired in 1989. It followed a production and management model similar to its counterparts: reduced external production, favoring in-house production, and consequently increasing staff. In the 1990s, many public televisions became deeply indebted as a result of the economic crisis of those years. That questioned the viability of regional public broadcasters. In the 2000s, they tried to reduce costs through the externalization of production, as this would require less staff and technical equipment (Casado et al., 2017). In the case of Canal 9, costs did not decrease because, despite externalization, the workforce continued to grow until it reached 1,700 employees and it acquired a debt of 1,200 million euros (Martín, 2013).

Canal 9 had an unstructured and unsustainable plan, with uncontrolled debt, and total political subjugation. Programming was built on external production, which generated a network of patronage. The local language was not respected, as many programs were broadcast in Spanish, and hundreds of words were censured for being excessively *Catalanish*.<sup>6</sup> The decrease of the network's audience share was constant from 2007 onward; the annual average reached 12.7% and dropped to 4% in 2013.

---

<sup>5</sup> The interviews were recorded in the Valencian language and translated by the authors.

<sup>6</sup> Although Catalan and Valencian are similar languages, the local language of the region is Valencian, and it has its own rules.

At first it had 800 employees and a budget equivalent to 41.5 million euros. Consecutive regional governments established their own dependable broadcasting staff, many of whom even belonged to the same political party. In the end, there were 1,700 employees. The public budget also increased significantly: During the period of 2000–8, it was raised from 189.8 to 269 million euros. After the crisis, it was reduced until only 154 million euros were approved for 2013. A highly deficient administration imbued with patronage and instrumentalization resulted in public television becoming an oversized, rigid, and ineffective media network. Finally, in 2012, the institution announced a reduction in force (RIF) to dismiss more than 1,000 employees. On November 5, 2013, the High Court of Justice of the Valencian Community annulled the decision for discriminatory behavior and inconsistency.

The regional government immediately responded, shutting the broadcaster down and alleging insufficient economic resources to reinstate its staff. The same day, November 6, 2013, the general director of the PSB, Rosa Vidal, resigned, alleging a lack of confidence in the government. Vidal had accepted the position one year before, when the RIF was approved, with the mission of reconfiguring the broadcaster. From there, employees took control of programming and replaced their attitude of conformism and complicit instrumentalization by a condemnatory and victimized discourse (Giménez, 2016). Finally, during the last 12 hours of the station's existence, staff barricaded themselves inside the studio, continuously narrating and broadcasting the chronicle of the station's closure. On November 29, 2013, police broke into the studio to interrupt the signal at 12:19 pm.

The audience paid attention to this crisis. The share of the principal channel (Canal 9) rose from 3.4% to 13.7% the day of the closure announcement. Of course, there were protests against the closure, but those coming from society did not last long. The audience was strongly disaffected with the instrumentalized, manipulated, and wasteful PSB, which had not accomplished its public obligations for some time. Later, it was worker's unions, cultural, and industrial associations, and academia that defended the need for a PSM. In 2014, a popular initiative led by social representatives collected 90,000 signatures petitioning for a new PSM. In 2016, the regional parliament approved the constitution of the Valencian Audiovisual Media Corporation (CVMC), owner of the new PSM, À Punt Media.

### ***The Case of À Punt Media***

#### *The Opening of a New Public Service Media*

The new public service media was a political promise made by the opposition parties at the time of the previous broadcaster's closure. When they came to government office in 2015, they ordered the recovery of public television. This new PSM was configured around three axes: multiplatform structure, recovery of the media industrial fabric, and application of public service values (objectivity, pluralism, media industry promotion, cultural development, both language and identity promotion, and territorial articulation). But it also faced three initial challenges: budget limitation, social disaffection, and the demand from former public workers who insisted on getting their jobs back. But this new PSM was a new company, unrelated to the old broadcaster, so there was no labor continuity.



APM became a multiplatform project that was self-defined as a convergent media network with different windows for different media technologies. It was composed of one television channel, one radio channel, one website, and two applications (one for general audiences and one for children). The total budget was 55 million euros per year, with a hiring ceiling of 351 employees. The PSM only produced information and news. The rest of the content (entertainment, fiction) was coproduced by regional producers or acquired. This follows the externalized model, applied by regional public televisions since the 2000s, which responds to the limited budget and the need to revitalize the regional production industry, which had practically disappeared after the previous broadcaster was closed down.

Its structure was organized around management needs, moving away from the traditional organization based on broadcasting channels (radio, television, Web, and social media). Therefore, the basic organization hinged on general management, on which three main departments depend: news management, content and program management, and engineering and operating management. On the third level, there were communication and advertising, style, social projection, and Web content services.

Temporary workers formed the initial staff. The applicants took part in a merit contest, where their experiences were rated. The workers who had been fired during the closure of the former broadcaster were given more highly rated than those applicants who were not in this situation. As a consequence, 71.7% of the journalists hired proceeded from the previous public television (EuropaPress, 2019), where multiplatform or digital skills were not required. It is also worth mentioning that the first-, second-, and third-level management positions were not subjected to the same hiring process as the rest of the staff. Although open nominations were accepted, the final decision was subject to a personal interview. In fact, in almost none of the cases did the recipient of the position have the highest merit rating. These managers were in a position of trust, which required a certain affinity between the general director and the managers.

In relation to audience support, APM is still facing difficulty obtaining market confidence due to its significantly low share (1.4% October–December 2018 average; 1.9% January–June 2019).

#### *Interviews: Challenges and Opportunities of a New PSM*

After the first phase of interview transcription and the subsequent qualitative analysis, we found 26 codes linked to opportunities ( $Gr = 26$ ) and 67 linked to challenges ( $Gr = 67$ ). Interviews are also codified, so a higher  $Gr$  number corresponds to a higher relevance in the interviewee's concerns. It was observed that the interviewees tended to unify the positive and negative aspects of the technology transition in the same areas of work. Thus, the challenges are also associated with opportunities for learning and developing the PSM. This first phase also revealed a set of categories under which the factors that cause such challenges can be identified. As a consequence, we chose to present the results following the identification of these five categories: functional, political, social, economic, and technological domains. Some factors may belong to more than one category.

*Functional: Structure and Dynamics of PSM*

The results reveal preferential attention to the functional aspects of media. The interviewees identified more challenges and opportunities linked to structure and work management (see Table 2).

**Table 2. Challenges and Opportunities for Functional Category.**

	OP. Gr = 26	CHALL. Gr = 67		OP. Gr = 26	CHALL. Gr = 67		OP. Gr = 26	CHALL. Gr = 67
Learning Gr = 1	1	1	Language Gr = 3	2	1	Precedent Gr = 3	1	2
Quality Gr = 2	1	1	Modernization Gr = 1	1	0	Proximity Gr = 1	1	1
Collective Gr = 2	1	1	Multiplatform Gr = 11	6	10	Advertising Gr = 2	1	2
content Gr = 5	1	4	New Gr = 13	4	9	Integrated newsroom Gr = 5	2	4
Coordination Gr = 1	1	0	Obsolescence Gr = 1	0	1	Time Gr = 5	1	5
◦differentiation Gr = 3	2	3	Organigram Gr = 4	3	1	Values Gr = 5	2	3
Work philosophy Gr = 17	4	17	Staff Gr = 14	2	12			

Note. OP: opportunities; CHALL: challenges; Gr = n: number of correlations with other codes

In particular, managers showed greater concern about staff members' adaptation to the new work philosophy. It should be noted that approximately three-quarters of the staff had worked at the previous broadcaster, which had developed an oversized structure as a result of poor management. Consequently, jobs were multiplied unnecessarily, which reduced the functions of each staff member to the minimum expression of their role. The dynamics were rigid, and staff functions highly compartmentalized.

In the current PSM, these same employees must adapt to a multiplatform workspace. This translates into a necessarily multifunctional capacity: New skills are required. Journalists must write, record, edit, and upload their content to the computer system, then send the information to be broadcast, doing everything from their desk. Information flow does not limit the schedule, as new posts are always required on social media. The configuration of an integrated newsroom has been a real adaptation challenge for journalists.

The managers have identified resistance in some of their employees to these new work dynamics as well as to the need for recycling technologies and skills. In the opinion of the managers, this situation is largely caused by the hiring system applied to the provisional staff of APM, which prioritized the entry of former employees, who were not adapted to the requirements of this new multiplatform media.

It is true that this is a new company, conceived in a different way, with a different structure. But we know that one of the things that need to be changed is mentality. And

when people have worked during 25 years in a specific way, it is very difficult to change their routines. (I7)

At the same time, some interviewees identified this new work methodology as an opportunity to take advantage of resources:

The integrated newsroom is a strength, because I think that they will make the most of journalistic resources in a single platform where people will be able to do journalism regardless of the windows to which it is directed. This will multiply the journalistic capacities of the house. (I2)

It should be noted that APM staff are provisional until final roles are established. Some staff members want to consolidate their positions with a public offer of employment, which necessarily requires adapting to the routines and dynamics of the new work culture. However, managers observe that some employees have a lack of incentives to improve their skills, because they are very close to retirement: "The weakest issue right now is the change of mentality. You have to think about television and radio and . . . the media in a different way. And I think many people who have joined do not have such thinking" (I10).

You see people who have worked in a specific way . . . who have come here for four years, five, or three if there is a public examination before, and go home. And that is sad. That makes our project difficult. (I1)

Bureaucracy associated with hiring personnel is also identified as one of the main challenges for the new network. The public administration requires that time be set aside for the publication of job openings, the publication of provisional lists, the period of reviews, and the publication of definitive lists. This process may take several months, during which different services must complete various tasks. The bureaucracy involved in public employment is an obstacle that responds to political and economic limitations: "If you want to hire a news presenter, of course, you cannot just hire him. He must be in the employment listings, because we are in the public administration. We knew that already" (I8).

Along with these administrative restrictions, the budget limitation appears as another axis of obstacles: "Everything requires money. And if we want to convince anyone who can divert money from the budget to something as important as this, then we have to convince them" (I1).

On the other hand, we find that pressure is generated from political players according to different interests. The government seeks to make its political promises tangible, while the opposition criticizes the viability of these promises and the expenses that are generated. APM needed to work intensively to minimize the length of the period before broadcasting started. Despite that, the launch of the television network experienced several delays. It was started in June 2018 rather than the original date of October 2017.

Faced with this situation, APM managers point out the complexity of executing a project that serves different windows simultaneously while starting from nothing. This places them under the inquisitive gaze of another regional PSM: "Within the framework of FORTA, there is great interest in

knowing how we will finally emerge from this project, and in identifying which parts are positive and which are problematic" (I7).

The initial challenge becomes an opportunity when it arises from an absence of previous work structures. The main obstacle faced by conventional broadcasters is precisely to address the technological transition from a consolidated organizational structure with divergent needs. All elements of the corporation are engaged in this transition, from staff organization to technological infrastructure. In the case of APM, this did not happen from the beginning, since there was no prior structure from which to make the transition: "We have been born with the opportunity and also the handicap of becoming integrated, because there is not a process of integration" (I13).

However, we noted that APM is faced with some of the same problems as the previous broadcaster related to the skills of its staff. In addition, the technological infrastructure of the previous institution was entirely obsolete for the new broadcasting and data management needs. APM also lacked a reference model from which to develop dynamics and workflows in the liquid structure it wanted to create: "Saying theoretically that we have an integrated newsroom is very beautiful, but we must make it work to create dynamics and workflows that effectively let us make the most of it" (I7).

The design of the organigram with three main functions (technology, programming, and news) seeks to conceive of the project from convergent dimensions. Its managers see this as an indisputable strength: "From the beginning, the general manager can plan communication strategies considering content, journalists, and engineers all together at the same table. . . . This makes the execution of the project much more efficient" (I2).

However, after the interviews, we deduced that the position of some departmental units at lower levels was confusing, even for those in charge of them. This hinders the understanding of those involved, and consequently, the dynamics of the relationship among the different units, as well as the identification of their respective functions. Particularly noteworthy is the situation of the Web content services unit, which was located under three subdepartments (programming, daily news, and nondaily news). However, the operating dynamics that were observed reflected a clear priority for attending to the information services, which require wider and more constant coverage. In practice, this service becomes a window for the dissemination of news. On the other hand, the social media department does not supervise the rest of the content (fiction, shows), which is delegated to producers. In addition, this subordination does not attend to the possible communications demands the corporation may need, as social media does not depend on the first levels of management.

Nevertheless, the management organization emerges as a strong item in the project, since it allows differentiation based on basic needs and resources: "One of the strongest issues is the concept of unique media. Although it is adventurous and requires technological effort, I believe that if all the pieces fit together, it will be our most basic strength" (I11).

The novelty that imbues the project, and the deadline for implementation were the most frequently highlighted aspects of the process. The challenge of implementing the management systems,

the work dynamics, and the technological infrastructure without direct or close reference models represents an obstacle for APM. In addition, the implementation is conducted with tight deadlines, and full resources are not always available.

Finally, opportunities for learning, content quality, collective work, the management of values and proximity, and differentiation with respect to the previous PSB are issues that were considered both positively and negatively by the interviewees. By "proximity" they refer to the regional nature of the PSM, which must provide local information, promote their own language, and safeguard their culture. Opportunities to generate novel content and work according to the flow of an integrated newsroom were considered a positive challenge, as was the opportunity to work with regional advertisers. Interviewees also spoke positively of the coordination among departments and the modernization of the Valencian language and the media.

#### *Political*

The factors related to budget assignment and bureaucratic complexity lead the political category (see Table 3); both condition the media's functionality, as we saw in previous results.

**Table 3. Challenges and Opportunities for Political Category.**

	OP. <i>Gr</i> = 26	CHALL. <i>Gr</i> = 67
Administration <i>Gr</i> = 7	0	7
Political consensus <i>Gr</i> = 1	0	1
Budget <i>Gr</i> = 8	0	10
Time <i>Gr</i> = 5	1	5

*Note.* OP: opportunities; CHALL: challenges; *Gr* = *n*: number of correlations with other codes

First, managers agree that the budget assigned to implement APM is largely insufficient. Despite being the fourth-most populated Spanish region (behind Andalusia, Catalonia, and Madrid), Valencian media is in sixth place in direct public funding. This means a loss of three positions compared with the former Valencian PSM (see Table 1): "We have not had a starting budget with guarantees from the beginning. This is a weak point, which should be attended to as soon as possible" (I11).

Public media funding can be between 0.3% and 0.6% of the total regional budget. At the start, it was set at 0.3% (55 million euros). For 2019, the general manager asked for a rise to 0.35% (70 million euros), which was denied (EFE, 2019).

Managers expressed both acceptance and critiques of their subordination to the public administration. The majority complained about administrative restrictions and faced these with resignation. On this matter, the administration's slowness comes into direct conflict with hastened working deadlines, which turn these factors into obstacles for the media management.

The timetable for developing the projects is like that; you must respect it and cannot do anything different. You must adapt to it. But that has led us to have, for instance, a

provisional website, and not proceed directly with the final one . . . and the workers' incorporation is also a difficult process, which began in early September [2017] and is still unfinished [May 2018]. (I13)

Nonetheless, there are critical voices within the system that support differentiated treatment for media compared with that for other areas under public administration, such as regional government counseling.

Another [challenge] is being subjected to the public administration. . . . Because this cannot be conceived as regional counseling and many times we are present . . . and this is media, it is absurd, and there is no way to make this understood. (I1)

Only one interviewee explicitly emphasized the absence of political consensus in the media as a matter of weakness, which has consequences for the quality of the public service offered: "Another weakness is to always be exposed to not having a state agreement on media, to be able to continue having a high quality under successive governments" (I11).

The managers of the new entity find that the difficulties derived from the political context are greater than those they encounter in their daily activities. The difficulties of the context arise from the lack of a solid political agreement among all the political parties on the importance of a regional public television. As a consequence, the media is still strongly subordinated to, and dependent on, the political system. The reopening of public television was a political act, as was its previous closure. The absence of political consensus, as well as the lack of an independent media council, hinders its stability.

### *Social*

Regarding social aspects, the audience is a principal concern for managers, all of whom agree that gaining Valencian society's attention and trust should be prioritized (see Table 4).

**Table 4. Challenges and Opportunities for Social Category.**

	OP. <i>Gr</i> = 26	CHALL. <i>Gr</i> = 67
Audience <i>Gr</i> = 14	1	12
Collective <i>Gr</i> = 2	1	1
Expectations <i>Gr</i> = 4	1	4
Youth <i>Gr</i> = 6	0	5
Language <i>Gr</i> = 3	2	1
Preceding <i>Gr</i> = 3	1	2
Proximity <i>Gr</i> = 1	1	1

*Note.* OP: opportunities; CHALL: challenges; *Gr* = *n*: number of correlations with other codes

The managers' aim is to involve the audience in supporting the APM project. However, they are working with a negative precedent, as the previous broadcaster ended in discredit after several years of political instrumentalization and social disaffection. This may explain the agreement among managers in

pointing out the strategic role of news and information for the new PSM: "We do not have to obsess over the audience . . . we must offer a good news service to reach an audience . . . what will be driving this forward is whether we can provide good information" (I1).

The directors introduce other factors such as the difficulty of having an impact on the younger audience or the challenge of adapting to current consumption habits.

You have to look for children's or youth content, . . . You have to try to get to them through other dynamics. A powerful platform, a strong app, social media. . . . You have to reach these young people first and then take them to the television. (I3)

A clear diagnosis of audience challenges was observed in the interviews, as well as a scarcity of strategy and coordination to tackle this challenge.

### *Technology*

Technological challenges are mainly associated with multiplatform diffusion and the PSM's development of a digital ecosystem (see Table 5): "We have many windows that we did not have in the past. . . . We have the radio, the television, and many social media, the website in streaming format and many others that did not exist" (I12).

We see APM as a combination of windows that show content that we want to give to the audience. . . . This is a relevant change regarding how things used to be done, which implies that we must pull our socks up and do things in other ways. (I15)

Both elements are understood as opportunities for progress and the ability to obtain the audience's attention. The multimedia character of the project has become a bastion for managers, who all highlighted the opportunity for development and adaptation to the digital ecosystem in which APM is born.

**Table 5. Challenges and Opportunities for Technological Category.**

	OP. <i>Gr</i> = 26	CHALL. <i>Gr</i> = 67
Learning <i>Gr</i> = 1	1	1
Digital ecosystem <i>Gr</i> = 9	3	8
Expectations <i>Gr</i> = 4	1	4
Multiplatform <i>Gr</i> = 11	6	10
Obsolescence <i>Gr</i> = 1	0	1
Proceedings <i>Gr</i> = 3	1	2
Technology <i>Gr</i> = 2	0	2

*Note.* OP: opportunities; CHALL: challenges; *Gr* = *n*: number of correlations with other codes

Nevertheless, the main obstacle associated with this ecosystem is determined by the need for adaptation to its scenario's logics of creation, distribution, and consumption. This adaptation is produced on two levels. The first is an internal level, based on the continuous learning and recycling of skills by

employees (with the subsequent resistance from some staff). Second, an external adaptation proceeds from local producers, who must introduce new narratives and production logics.

### *Economic*

The economic sphere is connected to the political sphere, conditioned by the public nature of the media service. Therefore, administrative and budget factors are challenges linked to this category (see Table 6).

**Table 6. Challenges and Opportunities for Economic Category.**

	OP. <i>Gr</i> = 26	CHALL. <i>Gr</i> = 67
Administration <i>Gr</i> = 7	0	7
Budget <i>Gr</i> = 8	0	10
Advertising <i>Gr</i> = 2	1	2

*Note.* OP: opportunities; CHALL: challenges; *Gr* = *n*: number of correlations with other codes

The new Valencian PSM received one-third of the previous service's budget in a decrease of investment from 31 euros per capita to 11.1 euros. The data position APM at the bottom of the list in public funding, alongside Madrid's PSM. On the opposite end of the spectrum, we find the Basque Country's PSM, with an investment of almost 60 euros per citizen (see Table 1).

The Valencian government approved 55 million euros for APM. Considering that technological infrastructure needed to be rebuilt, APM had difficulty incorporating proper content for a multimedia scenario: "With our budget, it is very hard to incorporate production designs and work to plan extra content to become transmedia. . . . We have received many . . . proposals that we could not take up at the moment" (I4).

Besides the technical resources endowment, which had become obsolete (recording, production, mobile units, technical equipment, software, hardware, etc.), the budget was required to cover content acquisition (APM did not want to use content from the previous broadcaster) and personnel expenses.

### **Conclusions**

The results of this study respond to the objectives set out at the beginning of the research. Managers clearly identify the challenges of creating a new public service media with organization skills, focusing on functional issues as well as technological aspects. In all these aspects, we find omnipresent problems linked to politics.

According to the managers' responses, culture, multiplatform, and budget are the three main challenges to be confronted in the creation of a new PSM. The scarcity of skills among the staff for convergent needs constitutes one main obstacle, which also occurred in other public service broadcasters, as seen in Larrondo and associates (2014), which had to modify decades-old work standards, also with resistance.



The main resistance to multiplatform adaptation came from a confrontation between professional culture, linked to old-fashioned standards, and new professional skills adapted to convergent dynamics. We must consider that these conclusions are partial, as they are based on the perspective of managers. Despite that, the results show that in 2018, resilience and resistance to change (Ryfe, 2009) are still challenges faced by public media.

Funding was also noted as an obstacle. This was not because of the funding model, but to scarcity of the budget. We found that public media principles, remit, and programming are not central issues, apart from the ways in which they overlap with organizational and funding areas. It is also noteworthy that managers do not consider governance in their discourse, except for the rigidity of bureaucracy, which drags out the hiring process. We noted slight signs of a biased configuration of the management team, which jeopardizes governance and transparency practices.

The results also confirm the conclusions of previous research (Larrondo, 2017; Larrondo et al., 2014; Salaverría & Negredo, 2009) about the identification of leadership areas in PSM. The interviewees identify the design of multiplatform content, the concerns about the young audience gap, and the integration of workspaces and convergence newsrooms, as some of the main areas requiring leadership. Further research that specifically focuses on the identification of new fields could extend these findings.

At a time when all public broadcasters are facing a transition to PSM, the case analyzed constitutes a small experiment to evaluate structural and functional design. Despite its singularity, it faces difficulties shared with other public media in transition, working against deeply rooted, rigid, and conventional dynamics while adapting to flexible, personal, and liquid workflows needed to give PSM their lead role in the digital era. Because of all of this, it can be seen as a lost opportunity, because despite APM was born as a new media, it also inherited old tensions (both political and professional) provoked by the previous broadcasting project.

In conclusion, this case study proves that a transition to PSM needs strong commitments, such as an effective governance system to give PSM neutrality and independence. Also required is a professional culture adapted to multiplatform dynamics, and a financing system that enables the PSM to research and innovate technology to lead the way within the digital ecosystem.

Experiences such as the case analyzed are exceptions, but very interesting ones because they can tell us what the challenges are for public broadcasters, especially those that are newly created. There are not many experiences of this kind, but they provide a wide knowledge about the real needs for public service media to succeed in a digital scenario. And above all, they reveal the importance of commitment and the need of political independence.

### References

- Aslama, M., & Syvertsen, T. (2007). Public service broadcasting and new technologies: Marginalization or re-monopolization? In E. De Bens (Ed.), *Media between culture and commerce* (pp. 167–178). Bristol, UK: Intellect.
- Blake, A. D., Lovegrove, N. C., Pryde, A., & Strauss, T. (1999). Keeping *Baywatch* at bay. *The McKinsey Quarterly*, 4, 18–27.
- Campos, F. (2017). El valor social de la televisión abierta [The social value of open television]. In E. Gutiérrez (Ed.), *Televisión Abierta. Situación actual y Tendencias de futuro de la TDT* (pp. 147–168). Retrieved from <https://www.coit.es/informes/television-abierta-situacion-actual-y-tendencias-de-futuro-de-la-tdt-ano-de-publicacion>
- Canavilhas, J. (2015). Nuevos medios, nuevo ecosistema [New media, new ecosystem]. *El Profesional de la Información*, 24(4), 357–362. doi:10.3145/epi.2015.jul.01
- Casado, M. A., Miguel-de-Bustos, J. C., & Sarabia, I. (2017). Medios públicos autonómicos: Merma en la financiación, gobierno parlamentario y externalización creciente [Autonomic public media: Decrease in funding, parliamentary government and growing outsourcing]. In I. Fernández (Ed.), *Austeridad y clientelismo. Política audiovisual en España en el contexto mediterráneo y de la crisis financiera* (pp. 197–218). Barcelona, Spain: Gedisa.
- Creeber, G., & Hills, M. (2007). TvIII: Into, or towards, a new television age? *New Review of Film and Television Studies*, 5(1), 1–4. doi:10.1080/17400300601140118
- Cunningham, S., & Silver, J. (2013). *Screen distribution and the new King Kongs of the online world*. New York, NY: Palgrave Pivot.
- Donders, K. (2012). *Public service media and policy in Europe*. London, UK: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Douzinas, C. (2013). *Philosophy and resistance in the crisis: Greece and the future of Europe*. Cambridge, UK: Polity.
- EFE. (2018, April 30). Las trece tv autonómicas recibirán casi mil millones de sus gobiernos en 2018 [The 13 autonomic TV will get almost a billion from their governments in 2018]. *Agencia EFE*. Retrieved from <https://www.efe.com/efe/comunitat-valenciana/patrocinada/las-trece-tv-autonomicas-recibiran-casi-mil-millones-de-sus-gobiernos-en-2018/50000886-3601033>
- EFE. (2019, October 25). Empar Marco reclama que el presupuesto de 2019 de À Punt pase de 55 a 70 millones de euros [Empar Marco demands that 2019 budget for À Punt raises from 55 to 70 million euros]. *Valencia Plaza*. Retrieved from <https://valenciaplaza.com/empar-marco-reclama-que-el-presupuesto-de-2019-de-a-punt-pase-de-55-a-70-millones-de-euros>

- EuropaPress. (2019, July 31). La Audiencia Nacional da la razón a À Punt y desestima la demanda de la bolsa de trabajo [The National Audience agrees with À Punt and dismisses the job bank]. *Las Provincias*. Retrieved from <https://www.lasprovincias.es/politica/demanda-punt-bolsa-20190731211602-nt.html>
- Fernández, I. (Ed.). (2017). *Austeridad y clientelismo. Política audiovisual en España en el contexto mediterráneo y de la crisis financiera* [Austerity and patronage. Audiovisual policy in Spain in the Mediterranean context and the financial crisis]. Barcelona, Spain: Paidós.
- Franquet, R. (2017). Estrategias de los servicios públicos de medios audiovisuales en el escenario cross-media [Strategies of media public services in the crossmedia scenario]. In J. Marzal, P. López-Rabadán, & J. Izquierdo-Castillo (Eds.), *Medios de comunicación públicos de proximidad en Europa* (pp. 179–196). Valencia, Spain: Tirant lo Blanch.
- Giménez, M. (2016, June 6). Los trabajadores de Canal 9: “Hubo manipulación y prácticas corruptas en la cobertura del accidente de metro” [Employees of Canal 9: “There was manipulation and corrupt practices in the coverage of the subway accident”]. *Eldiario*. Retrieved from [https://www.eldiario.es/cv/accidente-de-metro/Canal-manipulacion-corruptas-cobertura-accidente\\_0\\_523897743.html](https://www.eldiario.es/cv/accidente-de-metro/Canal-manipulacion-corruptas-cobertura-accidente_0_523897743.html)
- Hoffman, C. P., Lutz, C., Meckel, M., & Ranzini, G. (2015). Diversity by choice: Applying a social cognitive perspective to the role of public service media in the digital age. *International Journal of Communication*, 9, 1360–1381.
- Instituto Nacional de Estadística. (2018). *Instituto Nacional de Estadística INEBase 2018* [Statistics National Institute]. Retrieved from <https://www.ine.es/jaxiT3/Datos.htm?t=2853>
- Islas, O. (2009). La convergencia cultural a través de la ecología de los medios [The cultural convergence through media ecology]. *Comunicar*, 33(XVII), 25–33 doi:10.3916/c33-2009-02-002
- Izquierdo-Castillo, J. (2017). Who is watching TV? A revision of the generalist model in the converging media landscape scenario. *Trípodos*, 40, 31–54. Retrieved from [http://www.tripodos.com/index.php/Facultat\\_Comunicacio\\_Blanquerna/article/view/448/588](http://www.tripodos.com/index.php/Facultat_Comunicacio_Blanquerna/article/view/448/588)
- Izquierdo-Castillo, J., & López-Rabadán, P. (2016). New challenges and difficulties for public media of proximity. *adComunica*, 11, 19–21. doi:10.6035/2174-0992.2016.11.2
- Jenkins, H. (2008). *Convergence culture: La cultura de la convergencia de los medios de comunicación* [Convergence culture: The convergence culture in mass media]. Barcelona, Spain: Paidós.
- Larrondo, A. (2017). Innovation and strategic adaptation in the convergent scenario: The Basque news companies’ response. *Zer*, 22(42), 97–117. doi:10.1387/zer.17805

- Larrondo, A., Domingo, D., Erdal, I. J., Masip, P., & Van Den Bulck, H. (2014). Opportunities and limitations of newsroom convergence. A comparative study on European public service broadcasting organisations. *Journalism Studies*, 17(3), 277–300. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2014.977611
- Lowe, G. F., & Bardoel, J. (Eds.). (2007). *From public service broadcasting to public service media*. Göteborg, Sweden: Nordicom.
- Martín, A. (2013, November 6). Canal 9 echa el cierre acorralada por una gestión que elevó la deuda hasta 1.200 millones [Canal 9 closes cornered by a debt up to 1.2 billion]. *Radiotelevisión Española*. Retrieved from <https://www.rtve.es/noticias/20131106/canal-9-echa-cierre-acorralada-gestion-elevo-deuda-hasta-1200-millones/785460.shtml>
- Marzal, J., Izquierdo-Castillo, J., & Casero, A. (Eds.). (2015). *La crisis de la televisión pública. El caso de RTVV y los retos de una nueva gobernanza* [Public television crisis: The case of RTVV and the challenges of a new governance]. Barcelona, Spain: Universitat Pompeu Fabra. Colección Aldea Global.
- Marzal, J., López-Rabadán, P., & Izquierdo-Castillo, J. (Eds.). (2017). *Medios de comunicación públicos de proximidad en Europa* [Public media of proximity in Europe]. Valencia, Spain: Tirant lo Blanch.
- Mateos, C., Ruano, S., & Ardèvol, A. (2012). FORTA, coordinación estratégica de la radiotelevisión pública autonómica [FORTA, strategic coordination of autonomic public radio television]. In J. C. Miguel-de-Bustos & M. A. Casado (Eds.), *Televisión autonómicas. Evolución y crisis del modelo público de proximidad* (pp. 307–336). Barcelona, Spain: Gedisa.
- Maxwell, R. (1995). *The spectacle of democracy*. Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press.
- Maxwell, R., & Miller, T. (2011). Old, new and middle-aged media convergence. *Cultural Studies*, 25(4/5), 585–603. doi:10.1080/09502386.2011.600550
- Medina, M., & Ojer, T. (2009). Service public television assessing: Comparison among the BBC and TVE. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 64, 75–299. doi:10.4185/RLCS-64-2009-823-275-299
- Meier, H. E. (2003). Beyond convergence. Understanding programming strategies of public broadcasters in competitive environments. *European Journal of Communication*, 18(3), 337–365. doi:10.1177/02673231030183003
- Meike, G., & Young, S. (2008). Beyond broadcasting? TV for the twenty-first century. *Media International Australia*, 126(1), 67–70. doi:10.1177/1329878X0812600108

- Menke, M., Kinnebrock, S., Kretzchmar, S., Aichberger, I., Broersma, M., Hummel, R., . . . & Salaverría, R. (2016). Convergence culture in European newsrooms. Comparing editorial strategies for cross-media news production in six countries. *Journalism Studies*, 19(6), 881–904. doi:10.1080/1461670X.2016.1232175
- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass.
- Miguel-de-Bustos, J. C., & Casado, M. A. (Eds.). (2012). *Televisiónes autonómicas. Evolución y crisis del modelo público de proximidad* [Autonomic televisions: Evolution and crisis of a proximity public model]. Barcelona, Spain: Gedisa.
- Miguel-de-Bustos, J. C., & Izquierdo-Castillo, J. (2019). Who will control the media? The impact of GAFAM on the media industries in the digital economy. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 74, 803–821. doi:10.4185/RLCS-2019-1358en
- Moe, H. (2008). Public service media online? Regulating public broadcasters' Internet services. A comparative analysis. *Television & New Media*, 9(6), 220–238. doi:10.1177/1527476407307231
- Padovani, C. (2007). Would we create it if it did not exist? The evolution of public broadcasting Jamaica. *International Journal of Media and Cultural Politics*, 3(3), 215–234. doi:10.1386/macp.3.3.215/1
- Rowland, W. D., & Tracey, M. (1990). Worldwide challenges to public service broadcasting. *Journal of Communication*, 40(2), 8–27. doi:10.1111/j.1460-2466.1990.tb02259.x
- Ryfe, D. M. (2009). Broader and deeper: A study of newsroom culture in a time of change. *Journalism*, 10(2), 197–216. doi:10.1177/1464884908100601
- Salaverría, R., & Negredo, S. (2009). *Integrated journalism: Media convergence and newsroom organization*. Barcelona, Spain: Editorial Sol90 Media.
- Sarabia, I., Sánchez, J., & Fernández, I. (2012). La externalización como estrategia de creación del tercer canal. El caso de la televisión autonómica de Murcia [Externalization as a strategy for creation of third channel: The case of autonomic Murcia television]. *Trípodos*, 29, 101–115.
- Scolari, C. A. (2008). Hacia la hipertelevisión. Los primeros síntomas de una nueva configuración del dispositivo televisivo [Toward hypertelevision: The first symptoms of a new configuration of the television device]. *Diálogos de la Comunicación*, 77. Retrieved from <https://dialnet.unirioja.es/descarga/articulo/2694422.pdf>
- Scolari, C. A. (2015). (Ed.). *Ecología de los medios. Entornos, evoluciones e interpretaciones* [Media ecology: Environments, evolutions and interpretations]. Barcelona, Spain: Gedisa.

- Steeners, J. (2003). Public service broadcasting is not dead yet. In T. Hujanen & G. F. Lowe (Eds.), *Broadcasting and convergence: New articulations of the public service remit* (pp. 123–136). Göteborg, Sweden: Nordicom.
- Storsul, T., & Syvertsen, T. (2007). The impact of convergence on European television policy. *Convergence: The International Journal of Research into New Media Technologies*, 13(3), 275–291. doi:10.1177/1354856507079177
- Syvertsen, T. (2003). Challenges to public television in the era of convergence and commercialization. *Television & New Media*, 4(2), 155–175. doi:10.1177/1527476402250683
- Tracey, M. (1998). *The decline and fall of public service*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Trappel, J. (2008). Online media within the public service realm? Reasons to include online into de public service mission. *Convergence: The International Journal of Research into New Media Technologies*, 14(3), 313–322. doi:10.1177/1354856508091083
- Worldmeters. (2018). *European countries by population (2018)*. Retrieved from <https://www.worldometers.info/population/countries-in-europe-by-population/>
- Yin, K. (1994). *Case study research: Design and methods*. London, UK: SAGE Publications.
- Zallo, R. (2014, June 24). La era digital y sus oportunidades. Medios de comunicación, Internet y cambio democrático [Digital era and its opportunities: Media, Internet and democratic change]. *Vientosur*. Retrieved from <http://www.vientosur.info/spip.php?article9160>